



DRAFT MINUTES

LEGISLATIVE AUDIT SUBCOMMITTEE

Tuesday, November 19, 2024 | 4:00 p.m. | 445 State Capitol

Members Present:

President J. Stuart Adams, Co-chair
Speaker Mike Schultz, Co-chair
Sen. Luz Escamilla
Sen. Evan J. Vickers
Rep. Jefferson Moss

Rep. Angela Romero

Staff Present:

Brian J. Dean, Deputy Auditor General
Donna Hernandez, Office Manager
Darin R. Underwood, Deputy Auditor General
Kade R. Minchey, Auditor General

Note: A copy of related materials and an audio recording of the meeting can be found at www.le.utah.gov.

President Adams called the meeting to order at 4:00 PM.

1. Committee Business

MOTION: Representative Romero made a motion to approve the minutes from the October 15, 2024 meeting. The motion passed with a vote of 4 - 0 - 2.

Yeas - 4

Sen. J. Adams
Sen. L. Escamilla
Rep. A. Romero
Sen. E. Vickers

Nays - 0

Absent - 2

Rep. J. Moss
Rep. M. Schultz

2. Audit Report Presentations

Mr. Jesse Martinson, Audit Manager introduced A Performance Audit of the Utah System of Higher Education: A Review of System Collaboration, Efficiency and Workforce Alignment (Report #2024-22).

[A Performance Audit of the Utah System of Higher Education \(Report # 2024-22\)](#)

Mr. Martinson, Mr. Matthias Boone, and Mr. Nick Varney presented on the findings of the audit.

Mr. Boone responded to a question from Representative Romero regarding data points and the full picture of higher education.

Mr. Martinson responded to a follow-up question from Representative Romero on the cost of private institutions.

President Adams commented on the importance of the data points being used by institutions and by potential students to determine what is the best path to take regarding education.

Mr. Martinson, Mr. Boone, and Mr. Varney continued with the presentation on the findings of the audit.

Mr. Boone responded to a question from Representative Romero regarding the duplication of subjects being taught within different institutions.

Mr. Varney responded to a question from Speaker Schultz regarding the flexibility of institution presidents to make quick decisions about resources being used to meet workforce demands.

Mr. Martinson responded to a question from Speaker Schultz regarding institutions being able to meet the needs of students and employers.

Mr. Varney responded to questions from Speaker Schultz regarding;

- public universities losing the market share in high demand workforce areas,
- constraints regarding the nursing program,
- comparison between public universities and private institutions.

Mr. Boone commented on the loss of market share in high demand workforce areas.

Mr. Martinson responded to a question from Speaker Schultz regarding the cost of higher education and graduation rates in smaller programs.

Senator Vickers commented on what other states are doing regarding duplication of classes and guardrails on getting rid of classes. Senator Vickers stated that the Legislature should support the findings of this audit.

Mr. Martinson responded to a question from Representative Moss about meeting the needs of both students and the workforce better.

Representative Romero commented on concerns regarding choices on selecting private institutions because of shorter terms.

President Adams commented on the work by the Utah State Higher Education Board (UHSE) and the changes being made to ensure that students are given the skills they need to succeed.

Commissioner Geoff Landward responded virtually to the findings of the audit.

Speaker Schultz and President Adams publicly thanked Commissioner Landward for his efforts in solving the issues brought up in the audit.

Senator Escamilla commented with words of encouragement and the future of an integrated system and reallocation of resources.

MOTION: Speaker Schultz moved to refer A Performance Audit of the Utah System of Higher Education: A Review of System Collaboration, Efficiency and Workforce Alignment (Report #2024-22) to the Education Interim Committee as the lead committee and the Higher Education Appropriations Subcommittee as the review committee. The motion passed with a vote of 6 - 0 - 0.

Yeas - 6

Nays - 0

Absent - 0

Sen. J. Adams
Sen. L. Escamilla
Rep. J. Moss
Rep. A. Romero
Rep. M. Schultz
Sen. E. Vickers

Mr. Brian Dean, Deputy Auditor General introduced an In-Depth Follow-Up of the Salt Lake City School District (Report #2024-21).

[An In-Depth Follow-Up Audit of the Salt Lake City School District \(Report # 2024-21\)](#)

Mr. Dean and Mr. Christopher McClelland presented the findings of the audit.

Mr. McClelland responded to a question from President Adams on the time some students wait for a school bus.

Mr. McClelland and Mr. Dean continued with the presentation on the findings of the audit.

Mr. McClelland responded to a question from Representative Romero regarding the location of schools experiencing the delays on bus schedules.

Senator Escamilla thanked the audit team for their work on this audit and the information on shared governance. The Senator then thanked the Salt Lake City (SLC) School District for working on making changes based on the recommendations in the previous audit.

Mr. Dean responded to a question from Speaker Schultz regarding similarities between issues with shared governance in higher education and SLC School District.

Mr. McClelland responded to a question from Speaker Schultz regarding shared governance issues.

Representative Romero commented on the disparity of schools impacted by the shared governance.

Mr. Nate Salazar, Board President of SLC Board of Education and Dr. Elizabeth Grant, Superintendent of Schools, SLC School District responded to the findings of the audit.

Dr. Grant responded to a question from Speaker Schultz regarding potentially moving from a shared governance model.

MOTION: Speaker Schultz moved to refer An In-Depth Follow-Up of Audit of the Salt Lake City School District (Report #2024-21) to the Education Interim Committee as the lead committee and the Public Education Appropriations Subcommittee as the review committee. The motion passed with a vote of 6 - 0 - 0.

Yeas - 6

Nays - 0

Absent - 0

Sen. J. Adams
Sen. L. Escamilla
Rep. J. Moss
Rep. A. Romero
Rep. M. Schultz
Sen. E. Vickers

Mr. Darin Underwood, Deputy Auditor General introduced A Performance Audit of the OpenEd Program: Reviewing Educational Service Provider Funding and Improving Oversight (Report #2024-24).

[A Performance Audit of the OpenEd Program: Reviewing Educational Service Provider Funding and Improving Oversight \(Report #2024-24\)](#)

Mr. Underwood and Mr. Rusty Facer presented the findings of the audit.

Mr. Facer responded to a question from Representative Moss regarding funds being reimbursed to parents as part of the OpenEd program.

Ms. Molly Hart, Vice Chair of the Utah State Board of Education (USBE) responded virtually to the findings of the audit. Ms. Hart then mentioned the earlier audit report on higher education. This led to comments from the president and the speaker.

President Adams commented that 2 universities that tie closely to efforts being made in K-12 for concurrent enrollment that are the highest in the nation.

Speaker Schultz acknowledged the collaboration between UHSE and USBE and what makes Utah the best state in the nation.

Mr. Rick Nielsen, Superintendent of Nebo School District responded to the findings of the audit.

MOTION: Speaker Schultz moved to refer A Performance Audit of the OpenEd Program: Reviewing Educational Service Provider Funding and Improving Oversight (Report #2024-24) to the Education Interim Committee as the lead committee and the Public Education Appropriations Subcommittee as the review committee. The motion passed with a vote of 6 - 0 - 0.

Yeas - 6

Nays - 0

Absent - 0

Sen. J. Adams
Sen. L. Escamilla
Rep. J. Moss
Rep. A. Romero
Rep. M. Schultz
Sen. E. Vickers

Mr. Dean introduced A Performance Audit of Emergency Medical Transportation: A Review of Accountability and Rate-Setting (Report #2024-19).

[A Performance Audit of Emergency Medical Transportation: A Review of Accountability and Rate Setting](#)

Mr. Dean, Mr. McClelland and Mr. Tanner Cox presented the findings of the audit.

Mr. Darin Bushman, Director of the Bureau of Emergency Medical Services responded to the findings of the audit.

Mr. Bushman responded to questions from Speaker Schultz regarding:

- the number of public and private ambulance providers in the state,
- if they are allowed to compete for business in the market or only in specified locations,
- why other agencies are not allowed to compete in markets or locations,
- effect on the cost of the services being provided due to non-compete clause

MOTION: Speaker Schultz moved to refer A Performance Audit of Emergency Medical Transportation: A Review of Accountability and Rate-Setting (Report #2024-19) to the Law Enforcement and Criminal Justice Interim Committee as the lead committee and both the Business and Labor Interim Committee and the Health and Human Services Interim Committee as the joint review committees. The motion passed with a vote of 6 - 0 - 0.

Yeas - 6

Nays - 0

Absent - 0

Sen. J. Adams
Sen. L. Escamilla
Rep. J. Moss
Rep. A. Romero
Rep. M. Schultz
Sen. E. Vickers

3. Audit Report not Presented but Published with Subcommittee Approval

[Efficiency Evaluation Follow_up: State Records Committee Efficiency Evaluation Report \(Report #2024-25\)](#)

MOTION: Speaker Schultz moved to refer the Efficiency Evaluation Follow-Up: State Records Committee Efficiency Evaluation Report (Report #2024-25) to the Legislative Management Committee as the lead committee. The motion passed with a vote of 6 - 0 - 0.

Yeas - 6Nays - 0Absent - 0

Sen. J. Adams
Sen. L. Escamilla
Rep. J. Moss
Rep. A. Romero
Rep. M. Schultz
Sen. E. Vickers

Mr. Kade Minchey, Legislative Auditor General commented on the success of the Legislative Auditor General's office, the love for the work they do and expressed a desire for more audits in the future.

4. Prioritization of Audits

MOTION: Speaker Schultz moved to prioritize the following audits and give flexibility to the Auditor General to begin the audit as staff expertise and resources become available:

- A performance audit of the efficiency and effectiveness of police departments and district attorney offices in the state. The audit should specifically include the Salt Lake City Police Department and the Salt Lake County District Attorney's office,
- A systemic audit of the Office of the Inspector General of Medicaid Services,
- A systemic audit of the Department of Alcoholic Beverage Services. The motion passed with a vote of 6 - 0 - 0.

Yeas - 6Nays - 0Absent - 0

Sen. J. Adams
Sen. L. Escamilla
Rep. J. Moss
Rep. A. Romero
Rep. M. Schultz
Sen. E. Vickers

5. Adjourn

MOTION: Speaker Schultz made a motion to adjourn at 5:31 PM. The motion passed with a vote of 6 - 0 - 0.

Yeas - 6Nays - 0Absent - 0

Sen. J. Adams
Sen. L. Escamilla
Rep. J. Moss
Rep. A. Romero
Rep. M. Schultz
Sen. E. Vickers